BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631528 6

VOLUME 2

# CASES AND MATERIALS ON REMEDIES

prepared by

S.M. WADDAMS

[based on an earlier edition by R.J. Sharpe]

1984/85
1985/86

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

1984

LAW LIBRARY
JAN 7 1985
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

VOLUME 2

# CASES AND MATERIALS ON REMEDIES

prepared by

S.M. WADDAMS

[based on an earlier edition by R.J. Sharpe]

1984/85

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

1984

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson02wadd_0

# REMEDIES

## TABLE OF CONTENTS


| | | Page |
|---|---|---|
| Introduction | | |
| I | INJUNCTIONS | 1 |
| | Courts of Justice Act s. 114. | 1 |
| (a) | Interlocutory Injunctions | 2 |
| | (i) Types of Interlocutory orders: Century Engineering Co. v. Greto et al. | 2 |
| | (ii) Principles Governing the Granting of Interlocutory Injunctions: Terra Communications Ltd. et al. v. Communicomp Data Ltd. et al. | 3 |
| | Salada Foods v. W. K. Buckley | 12 |
| | Dodd v. Amalgamated Marine Workers' Union | 14 |
| | Woodford v. Smith | 15 |
| | (iii) Irreparable Harm | 16 |
| | The Attorney-General v. Hallett | 17 |
| | (iv) Undertaking as to Damages: Vieweger Construction Co. Ltd. v. Rush & Tompkins Construction Ltd. | 18 |
| | Wm. Halliday Contracting Co. Ltd. v. Nicols et al. | 20 |
| | Upper Canada College v. City of Toronto | 22 |
| | F. Hoffman - La Roche & Co. A.G. v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry | 24 |
| | (v) The Requirement for a "Prima Facie" Case: | 25 |
| | American Cynamid Co. v. Ethicon Ltd. | 25 |
| | Toronto Marlboros v. Tonelli | 31 |
| | Yule v. Atlantic Pizza Delight Franchise | 32 |
| | Carlton Realty Co. Ltd. v. Maple Leaf Mills Ltd. | 37 |
| | Fellowes & Son v. Fisher | 38 |
| | Cantol v. Brodi Chemicals | 47 |
| | N.W.L. Ltd. v. Woods | 48 |
| | Bruce, "The New Injunction Game" | 49 |
| | (vi) Interlocutory Injunctions in Labour Disputes | 51 |
| | Texpack Ltd. v. Rowley | 54 |
| | Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd. v. McDermott | 57 |
| | Alex Henry & Sons Ltd. v. Gale et al. | 61 |
| | Consolidated-Bathurst Packaging Ltd. v. Canadian Paper Workers Union Local 595 et al. | 64 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| (vii) | Interlocutory Injunctions in Defamation Actions | 68 |
| | Blackstone Commentaries Book IV | 68 |
| | Bonnard v. Perryman | 69 |
| | Canada Metal Co. Ltd. et al. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. et al. | 72 |
| | Canada Metal Co. Ltd. et al. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. et al. | 78 |
| | Canada Metal Co. Ltd. et al. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. et al. | 80 |
| | Canada Metal Co. Ltd. et al. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. et al. | 81 |
| | A.G. v. Times Newspapers | 82 |
| | Miller, Contempt of Court | 85 |
| | Schering Chemicals Ltd. v. Falkman Ltd. and others | 93 |
| (viii) | Interlocutory Injunctions to Restrain Disposition of Assets Pending Trial | 100 |
| | Mareva Compania Naviera S.A. v. International Bulkcarriers S.A. | 100 |
| | Rahman (Prince Abdul) Bin Turki Al Sudairy v. Abu-Taha and another | 102 |
| | Third Chandris Shipping Corp. et al. v. Unimarine S.A. | 105 |
| | Z. Ltd. v. A.-Z. and AA-LL | 105 |
| | Trustee of W. Brenner & Co. Ltd. v. Brenner | 117 |
| | Mageau v. Mageau | 118 |
| | Campbell v. Campbell | 119 |
| | Robert Reiser & Co., Inc. v. Nadore Food Processing Equipment Ltd. et al. | 119 |
| | Chitel v. Rothbrat | 120 |
| | Feigelman v. Aetna Financial Services | 133 |
| (ix) | The "Anton Piller" Injunction | 145 |
| | Anton Piller K.G. v. Manufacturing Processes Ltd. et al. | 145 |
| | Yousif v. Salama | 148 |
| | Rank Film Ltd. v. Video Information Centre | 150 |
| | West Mercia Constabulary v. Wagner and Others | 153 |
| | Bardeau Ltd. v. Crown Food Services Equipment Ltd. | 156 |
| | Hayhurst, "The Anton Piller Order" | 157 |
| (x) | Injunctions to Restrain the Commission of a Crime | 158 |
| | Attorney-General for Ontario v. Grabarchuk et al. | 158 |

Attorney-General for Ontario v. Garbarchuk et al. 160

Attorney-General for Ontario v. Yeotes et al. 163

Attorney-General for Ontario v. Harry et al. 163

Attorney-General for Ontario v. Canadian Union of Public Employees 165

Re Regina and Odeon Morton Theatres Ltd. et al. 167

Kent District v. Storgoff et al. and Attorney General for British Columbia 168

Gouriet v. U.P.W. 172

Ex parte Island Records Ltd. and Others 187

(b) Permanent Injunctions 200

(i) Quia Timet 200

Fletcher v. Bealey 200

Leeds Industrial Co-operative Society v. Slack 204

Hooper v. Rogers 205

(ii) Mandatory Injunctions 207

Redland Bricks Ltd. v. Morris 207

Vane v. Barnard 211

Gross v. Wright 212

City of Hamilton v. Hamilton Street R.W. Co. 215

Wrotham Park Estate Co. Ltd. v. Parkside Homes Ltd. 216

Arbutus Park Estates Ltd. v. Fuller 221

Shepherd Homes Ltd. v. Sandham 222

(iii) Injunctions Relating to Trespass and Nuisance 226

(a) Trespass 226

Goodson v. Richardson 226

Woollerton and Wilson Ltd. v. Richard Constain Ltd. 229

Charrington v. Simons & Co. Ltd. 232

John Trenberth Ltd. v. National Westminster Bank Ltd. and Another 234

Bertram v. Builders' Association of North Winnipeg 236

(b) Nuisance 238

Sharpe, Injunctions and Specific Performance 238

Colls v. Home & Colonist Stores Ltd. 244

Isenberg v. East India House Estate Co. Ltd. 245

Shelfer v. City of London Electric Lighting Co. 247

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | Canada Paper Co. v. A.J. Brown | 250 |
| | Chadwick v. City of Toronto | 254 |
| | Black v. Canadian Copper | 254 |
| | Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco Co. Ltd. | 255 |
| | K.V.P. Company Ltd. v. McKie | 255 |
| | An Act respecting the K.V.P. Co.Ltd. | 258 |
| | Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co. Inc. | 259 |
| | Miller et al. v. Jackson et al. | 263 |
| | Kennaway v. Thompson | 269 |
| | Spur Industries Inc. v. Del E. Webb Development | 273 |
| | Problem | 278 |
| | Draft revised Judicature Act | 279 |
| II | SPECIFIC PERFORMANCE | 280 |
| | (i) Introduction | 280 |
| | (ii) Damages, Mitigation and Specific Performance | 281 |
| | Robinson v. Harman | 281 |
| | Asamera Oil Corp. Ltd. v. Sea Oil & General Corp. et al; Bank Corp., N.V. v. Brook | 281 |
| | Problem | 294 |
| | Dodd Properties v. Canterbury City Council | 295 |
| | Perry v. Sidney Phillips & Sons | 301 |
| | Posner, Economic Analysis of Law | 304 |
| | Radford v. DeFroberville | 307 |
| | Groves v. John Wunder Co. | 313 |
| | Miles v. Marshall | 316 |
| | Dewees v. Morrow | 317 |
| | C.R. Taylor v. Hepworths Ltd. | 319 |

VOLUME 2


| | | |
|---|---|---|
| (iii) | Damages in Lieu of Specific Performance | 326 |
| | Courts of Justice Act, s. 112 | 326 |
| | Wroth v. Tyler | 326 |
| | Metropolitan Trust Co. of Canada v. Pressure Concrete Ltd. | 334 |
| | Johnson v. Agnew | 337 |
| | Problem | 343 |
| | 306793 Ontario Ltd. in Trust v. Rimes | 344 |
| (iv) | Injunction to Restrain Breach of Contract | 349 |
| | Fothergill v. Rowland | 349 |
| | Doherty v. Allman | 352 |
| | Sharp v. Harrison | 354 |
| | Texaco Ltd. v. Mulberry Filling Station Ltd. | 354 |
| | Detroit Football Company v. Dublinski | 359 |
| | Donnell v. Bennett | 368 |
| | Metropolitan Electric Supply Co. Ltd. v. Ginder | 370 |
| | Toronto Type Foundry Co. Ltd. v. Leach | 373 |
| (v) | Party Stipulation for Specific Relief | 377 |
| | Warner Bros. v. Nelson | 377 |
| (vi) | Liquidated Damages | 378 |
| | H.F. Clarke Ltd. v. Thermidaire Corp. Ltd. | 378 |
| | Elsley v. J.G. Collins Ins. Agencies Ltd. | 368 |
| (vii) | Contracts for the Purchase and Sale of Chattels | 391 |
| | Dominion Iron & Steel Co. v. Dominion Coal Co. | 391 |
| | Farwell v. Wallbridge | 395 |
| | Sky Petroleum v. V.I.P. Petroleum | 395 |
| | Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on Sale of Goods | 397A |
| (viii) | Contracts for the Purchase and Sale of Land | 403 |
| (ix) | Contracts Requiring Continuing Supervision | 406 |
| | Wilson v. Furness Railway Co. | 407 |
| | Tanenbaum v. W.J. Bell Paper Co. | 408 |
| | G.H. Giles & Co. v. Morris | 412 |
| | Hill v. C.A. Parsons & Co. Ltd. | 413 |
| | Note: The Problem of Supervision | 421 |

(x) Discretionary Defences 423

McCorkell v. McFarlane 423

Hope v. Walter 425

(xi) Timing of the Action and Election of Remedies 427

Kloepfer Wholesale Hardware and Automotive Ltd. v. Roy 427

Macnaughton v. Stone 429

Dobson v, Winton & Robbins Ltd, 432

Lyew v, 418658 Ontario Ltd, 437

III AWARDS MEASURED BY BENEFIT TO DEFENDANT 438

Street, Principles of the Law of Damages 438

Copyright Act 443

United Australia Ltd. v. Barclays Bank Ltd. 444

Phillips v. Homfray 450

Whitwham v. Westminster Brymbo Coal & Coke Co. 453

Wrotham Park Estate Co. v. Parksides Homes Ltd. 453A

Mahesan v. Malaysia Housing Society 454

Strand Electric & Engineering Co. Ltd. v. Brisford Entertainments Ltd. 457

Peter Pan Manufacturing Corporation v. Corsets Silhouette, Ltd. 459

Seager v. Copydex Ltd. 461

Townsview Properties Ltd. v. Sun Construction & Equipment Co. Ltd. 462

Rookes v. Barnard 463

Broome v. Cassell 463

IV DAMAGES FOR PERSONAL INJURIES 465

(a) Periodic Payments and Non-Pecuniary Loss 465

Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. 465

Lim Poh Choo v. Camden and Islington Area Health Authority 479

Committee on Tort Compensation - Extracts from Report 489

Lindal v. Lindal 513

(b) Assessment of Pecuniary Loss 520

The Queen v, Jennings 520

Pickett v. British Rail Engineering Ltd, 525

Donnelly v. Joyce 529

Daly v, General Steam Navigation Co, Ltd, 533

(c) Collateral Benefits 536

Parry v. Cleaver 536

Boarelli v. Flannigan 539

Guy v. Trizec Equities Ltd. 547

Jack Cewe Ltd. v. Jorgenson 551

(d) Wrongful Death and Third Party Losses 554

Keizer v. Hanna 554

Family Law Reform Act (Ontario) 1978 559

Zik v. High 561

Mason v. Peters 563

(e) Action by the Estate 571

Trustee Act (Ontario) 571

Gammell v. Wilson 571

(f) Mental Distress on Breach of Contract 576

Jarvis v. Swans Tours Ltd. 576

Pilon v. Peugeot Canada Ltd. 579

Brown v. Waterloo Regional Board of Commissioners 583

V COMPENSATION FOR LOSS OF MONEY 593

(a) Damages and Inflation 593

Leitch Transport Ltd. v. Neonex International Ltd. 593

(b) Prejudgment Interest 599

Courts of Justice Act s. 137 & s. 138 599

(c) Foreign Currency Obligations 600

Miliangos v. George Frank (Textiles) Ltd. 600

Batavia Times Publishing Co. v. Davis 607

Clinton v. Ford 613

Courts of Justice Act s. 131 613

VI. EXEMPLARY DAMAGES 614

Cassell & Co. Ltd. v. Broome 614

H.L. Weiss Forwarding Ltd. v. Omnus 619

Brown v. Waterloo Regional Board of Commissioners of Police 621

VII LOSS OF USE OF PROPERTY 626

(a) Decline in Value 626

Wertheim v. Chicoutimi Pulp Company 626

Brandeis Goldschmidt & Co. Ltd. v. Western Transport Ltd. 629

(b) Non Profit-Making Chattels 631

The Mediana 631

VIII EVENTS OCCURRING AFTER THE WRONG 634

Baker v. Willoughby 634

Jobling v. Associated Dairies Ltd. 637

Dormuth v. Untereiner 639

Mercer v. Sijan 642

IX REMOTENESS 644

H. Parsons (Livestock) Ltd. v. Uttley Ingham & Co .Ltd. 644

Kienzle v. Stringer 648

X MITIGATION 651

(a) Provocation in Intentional Torts 651

Landry v. Patterson 651

(b) Valuation of Chance of Avoiding Loss 654

Ippolito v. Janiak 654

(c) Anticipatory Breach 662

Sells v. Thomson 662

Finelli v. Dee 663

(d) Avoided Loss 664

Erie County Natural Gas and Fuel Company v. Carroll 664

Cockburn v. Trusts & Guarantee Co. 667

Jamal v. Moolla Dawood Sons & Co. 668

Campbell Mostyn (Provisions) Ltd. v. Barnett Trading Co. 671

Slater v. Hoyle & Smith Ltd. 673

Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Sales of Goods (1979) 675